

**DECISION
GRAFTON PLANNING BOARD**

**PROJECT PLAN REVIEW (PPR 2016-1)
(Pursuant to Section 9.6.1.2 of the Grafton Zoning By-law)**

**Equine Sports Medicine Center and Associated Parking
53 Willard Street, North Grafton**

**Tufts University/Cummings School of Veterinary Medicine (Applicant)
200 Westboro Road, North Grafton, MA 01536**

Decision of the Grafton Planning Board (hereinafter the BOARD) on the petition of Tufts University / Cummings School of Veterinary Medicine, 200 Westboro Road, North Grafton, MA (hereinafter the APPLICANT), for Project Plan Review, pursuant to Section 9.6.1.2 of the Grafton Zoning By-law, for the renovation and addition to the Foster Hospital for Small Animals. The project is located at 53 Willard Street, North Grafton, MA (hereinafter the SITE). Said property is owned by the Trustees of Tufts College.

I. BACKGROUND

The petition for the above referenced Project Plan Review (hereinafter Application) was submitted on March 30, 2016. Notice of the public meeting and the subject matter thereof was published in the Grafton News on April 14, 2016 (in accordance with the requirements of Section 9.6.1.3 of the Zoning By-law), and posted with the Town Clerk's Office. The public meeting was held on April 25, 2016 and continued to May 16, 2016.

The following Board members were present during the public meeting: Sargon Hanna, Michael Scully, David Robbins, Robert Hassinger and Linda Hassinger. **At the time of Decision Sargon Hanna was no longer a member of the Planning Board.** At the hearing, Dean Deborah Kochevar, Tufts Senior Campus Planner Jean Poteete and Eric Vangsness of Waterman Design Associates presented the Application on behalf of the Owner. At the public meeting, all those wishing to speak to the petition were heard.

II. SUBMITTALS

The following items were submitted to the Board for its consideration of this application:

EXHIBIT 1. Unbound Application packet submitted by Jean Poteete, Senior Campus Planner, Tufts University / Cummings School of Veterinary Medicine, received March 30, 2016; including the following:

- Copy of Correspondence to the Grafton Town Clerk from Tufts University, Project Plan Submission –Hospital for Large Animals (HLA) Equine Sports Medicine Center, 53 Willard Street; dated March 30, 2016; 1 page.
- Correspondence from Tufts University, Project Plan Submission –Hospital for Large Animals (HLA) Equine Sports Medicine Center, 53 Willard Street; dated March 30, 2016; 10 pages.
- Stormwater Management Report for Equine Area, Willard Road, North Grafton, Massachusetts; prepared by Waterman Design Associates, Inc.; dated March 2016; 43 pages.

- Plan Set: Project Plan Review for Proposed Equine Arena, The Cummings School of Veterinary Medicine at Tufts University; prepared by Waterman Design Associate, Inc.; 24” x 36” and 11” x 17”, color; dated March 29, 2016; fourteen sheets as follows:

Cover Sheet

- 1. Existing Conditions Plan
- 2. Overview Plan
- 3. Site Demolition Plan
- 4. Layout and Materials Plan
- 5. Grading, Drainage and Utilities Plan
- 6. Turning Movement Exhibit (Fire Truck)
- 7. – 10. ... Construction Details
- A100. Main Floor Plan
- A101 Elevations
- A102 Elevations
- F1.1 Fire Protection Floor Plan

EXHIBIT 2. Notice of Public Meeting, Town of Grafton Planning Board; 1 page.

EXHIBIT 3. Project Review Memorandum, Zoning Board of Appeals, received April 21, 2016; 1 page.

EXHIBIT 4. Public Meeting Sign In Sheet for April 25, 2016; 1 page.

EXHIBIT 5. Project Slide Presentation; Hospital for Large Animals (HLA) – Equine Sports Medicine Complex (SCMC); presented at the Public Meeting on April 25, 2016; color; 18 pages.

EXHIBIT 6. Correspondence from Graves Engineering, Tufts University – Equine Arena, Project Plan Review; dated April 15, 2016, received April 28, 2016; 2 pages.

EXHIBIT 7. Correspondence from Waterman Design Associates, Inc.; Project Plan Review, Equine Arena & Shared Parking Facility, The Cuming School of Veterinary Medicine at Tufts University; dated and received May 6, 2016; 2 pages; includes the following attachments:

- Stormwater Management Report for Equine Area, Willard Road, North Grafton, Massachusetts; prepared by Waterman Design Associates, Inc.; revised May 2016; 43 pages.
- Plan Set: Project Plan Review for Proposed Equine Arena, The Cummings School of Veterinary Medicine at Tufts University; prepared by Waterman Design Associate, Inc.; 24” x 36” and 11” x 17”, color; dated March 29, 2016, revised May 6, 2016; fourteen sheets as follows:

Cover Sheet

- 1. Overview Plan
- 2. Index Plan
- 3. – 4. Existing Conditions Plan
- 5. Site Preparation and Demolition Plan
- 6. Layout and Materials Plan
- 7. – 8. Grading, Drainage and Utilities Plan
- 9. Turning Movement Exhibit (Fire Truck)

- 10. – 13. Construction Details
- A100. Main Floor Plan
- A101 Elevations
- A102 Elevations
- F1.1 Fire Protection Floor Plan

EXHIBIT 8. Correspondence from Graves Engineering, Tufts University – Equine Arena, Project Plan Review; dated April 15, 2016, received May 12, 2016; 2 pages.

EXHIBIT 9. Public Meeting Sign In Sheet for May 16, 2016; 1 page.

III. FINDINGS

At their meeting of [REDACTED] after due consideration of the exhibits submitted and the entire record of proceedings introduced and accepted in this matter, the Grafton Planning Board (motion by [REDACTED], seconded by [REDACTED]) voted [REDACTED] to make the following Findings:

- F1. That determinations regarding the following findings are based upon the plans identified in this Decision, as well as the information and materials submitted and presented in association with the Application.
- F2. That determinations regarding the following findings are also predicated upon satisfactory completion of the work and site improvements shown on the Plans and maintenance of the Site in accordance with this Decision, as well as all applicable Federal, State and Local regulations, except where modified by this Decision.
- F3. That the subject Site is located in an Office/Light Industrial (OLI) Zoning District and the Campus Development Overlay (CDO) District.
- F4. That the subject Site is located on property included as part of, and subject to, a Master Plan Approval granted by the Grafton Planning Board for the Tufts Campus pursuant to Section 9.6 of the Grafton Zoning By-law (hereinafter ZBL) and updated in 2014.
- F5. That this Application is for Project Plan Review, pursuant to Section 9.6.1.2 of the ZBL, for the construction of 14,364 square foot equine sports medicine complex and associated parking as shown on the plans and materials identified within the Exhibits of this Decision.
- F6. That Project Plan Review submissions are required for individual projects within the CDO District provided that: such project is located on property previously approved as part of a Master Plan pursuant to Section 9.6 of the ZBL; said Master Plan Approval is still in effect under Section 9.6.1.4 of the ZBL; and, that such project is for a use permitted under Section 9.4 of the ZBL.
- F7. That Section 9.6.1.3 of the ZBL requires, for the purposes of Project Plan Review, that the Planning Board make a determination as to whether or not the submission meets the requirements of Section 9 of the ZBL. The Board further finds that Section 9.6.1.3 sets forth the procedure for review of Project Plan submissions by the Planning Board.

At their meeting of [REDACTED] after due consideration of the exhibits submitted and the entire record of proceedings introduced and accepted in this matter, the Grafton Planning Board (motion by [REDACTED], seconded by [REDACTED]) voted [REDACTED] - [REDACTED] to make the following Findings:

- F8. That during the public meeting the Applicant reviewed the project which includes the following elements as follows (see EXHIBITS #1, #5 and #7):

Expansion of Hospital for Large Animals (HLA) Facilities / Construction of Equine Sports Medicine Complex: The Applicant proposes to construct a new structure consisting of 14,364 total square feet to be located to the southeast of the existing structure which houses the Foster Hospital for Small Animals and the Hospital for Large Animals. The new structure will be used to expand the function of the Large Animal Hospital for equine evaluations and therapies. This structure will replace the outdoor lunge ring.

Exterior: The new building will not exceed a height of 36.4 feet which is lower than the maximum allowed height of 60 feet. Elevations and renderings show that the building will have two functional areas integrated into one building. In addition, there is an outdoor exercise area located to the north of the new building.

Interior: The space will be divided into two areas: a 9,600 square foot unheated arena for therapy and exercise and 4,764 square feet of heated support space. The arena has a small viewing area for observation of work conducted in the ring below. Approximately 2/3rds of the support space will be utilized for meeting areas, tack rooms, equine exam area and other support spaces for evaluations, diagnostic procedures and teaching. A portion of the area is not programmed at this time but will be utilized in the future as the program expands.

Parking and Site Circulation: The site design for the new building results in relocating 12 spaces from the existing lunge ring area onto Jumbo's Path, creation of a new parking area to accommodate trucks and trailers and expansion of the adjacent parking area to the north. Based on the requirements of the Campus Master Plan there will be a total of net new 20 parking spaces and one new trailer parking space/ The purpose of this design is to provide adequate parking space, improve site circulation, and integrate building entrances for both the Small and Large Animal Hospitals. Pedestrian access ways are provided and are separate from the vehicular movement and parking areas.

- F9. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed need for the project. The Applicant noted that this facility would enable the Large Animal Hospital to remain competitive with other similar facilities in providing an all season facility that accommodated various aspects of equine diagnostics and therapies. Additional factors cited include: ongoing work to improve and better utilize the existing HLA and to increase the equine caseload revenue thereby decreasing the schools operating deficit. Ms. Kochevar noted that no additional staff is required to operate the new facility. The Board asked if this new facility would result in closing or limited use of the existing Large Animal Hospital. The Applicant stated that they are evaluating their options from a budget and functionality perspective but haven't made any decisions thus far.

- F10. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed the impacts of this project as it relates to Campus Master Plan and the Campus Development Overlay District requirements. The Applicant reviewed the proposed project against the following requirements: lot dimensions, height,

setbacks, building separation, accessibility, ground coverage, buffers & landscaping, ways, parking, loading areas and use (see EXHIBIT #1). The Applicant stated that all these requirements had been met. In addition, it was noted that this project concept had been presented as part of the 2014 Campus Master Plan update which was approved by the Board. The Board found the analyses to be in order.

- F11. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed project time line. Dean Kochevar stated that the project was being primarily funded by a private donation and that they expected work to commence immediately upon approval by the Town. A six month construction period is anticipated (see EXHIBIT #5).
- F12. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed stormwater and drainage. The new construction and site plan will result in an increase of 116% of impervious surface (see EXHIBIT #1). The original design for the system was presented at the start of the public meeting. Subsequent soil testing revealed that the original stormwater management design was inadequate. A second stormwater drainage design was presented to the Board along with revised plans and stormwater management report (see EXHIBIT #7). The new system involves on site collection to be directed via pipe north under Route 30 to be discharge into a new open stormwater basin with a perimeter berm. This system would not tie into the Town's system located under Route 30. The Town's system which was found to be inadequate as the existing 12 inch pipe would not be able to accommodate the site design. The Applicant noted that the new open stormwater basin would require the relocation of an existing nature trail. The Board and the Applicant reviewed the new open stormwater basin system with regards to materials and overflow. This is a new system that will be private with no connections to the Town's system. It will improve the existing conditions for the Town system as some of the existing stormwater currently piped from site will be directed into the new system thereby reducing the amount of intake into the Town's system. The Board asked about maintenance and inspections to ensure that the new system works and will not impact the right of way or surrounding areas. The Applicant noted that their operations and management plan requires them to submit regular reports to the Town regarding infrastructure and this new system would be evaluated and reported upon as part of the campus system. The Board wanted some form of assurance that any failure of the system would be the responsibility of the Applicant and recommended that a memorandum of understanding be required as part of an approval.
- F13. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed peer review comments. It was noted that Graves Engineering had submitted a tow project review letters (see EXHIBITS #6 and #8) which noted that:
- the project was consistent with the campus master plan as updated through 2014;
 - was in compliance with Section 9 of the Grafton Zoning By Law (Campus Development Overlay District)
 - the hydrology, drainage and stormwater management issues had been satisfactorily addressed;
 - there were no outstanding issues relative to the Stormwater Management report; and
 - there were no engineering-related issues with the plans and supporting documentation.
- F14. That during the public meeting the Board and the Applicant discussed the proposed parking area as it relates to site circulation. The site plan shows at total of six trailer parking spaces that are 15 feet wide and of variable lengths. These are situated in a manner that will allow for pull through

capability for vehicles of varying length including large horse trailers. These spaces will be used for parking. The Applicant stated that horses will be off loaded at either the HLA or new facility and that the vehicles will park in the new spaces. It was noted that most people transporting horses to their site call in advance and that staff are ready to assist at the time of arrival. The Applicant demonstrated that there was enough turning area to enter and exit the site. The entrance and exit are both one way to eliminate vehicular conflict. The Board asked if there was any conflict between vehicular movements and pedestrian access and movement on the site. The Applicant noted that there were no conflicts and that the pedestrian walkways were separated from the parking area to provide a safe environment as well as handicap accessibility. It was further noted that an analysis was done to ensure adequate turning movements for fire trucks (see EXHIBITS #1 and #7).

- F15. That during the public hearing the Board and the Applicant discussed signage. The Applicant noted no site identification signage beyond the required vehicular and pedestrian safety signage is proposed at this time. It was noted that any future signage would comply with Section 9.6.4.3 of the Zoning By-Law (see EXHIBIT #1).
- F16. That during the public meeting the Board noted that the Fire Department had requested the relocation of a fire hydrant. The hydrant in question is located within the parking area currently under construction to the north to this site. The Applicant noted that they need to move the hydrant to construct the new parking lot and that the new location appears on the plan set (see EXHIBIT #7). It was agreed that the hydrant would be moved in a timely manner to satisfy the concerns of the Fire Department.
- F17. That during the public hearing the Board noted that a Stormwater Management Permit pursuant to the Grafton General By-Laws may be required and that the Applicant should coordinate with the Conservation Agent on that determination.
- F18. The Board notes that it received correspondence from the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA) regarding requests for comments. The ZBA stated that they had no comment.
- F19. The Board notes that no public input was received during the public meeting.

At their meeting of [REDACTED] after due consideration of the exhibits submitted and the entire record of proceedings introduced and accepted in this matter, the Grafton Planning Board (motion by [REDACTED], seconded by [REDACTED]) voted [REDACTED] to make the following Findings:

- F20. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.1.2 (A) through (D) with regard to project plan submittal requirements.
- F21. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.2.1 with regard to lot dimensions. (See EXHIBIT #7 and FINDING #F10.)
- F22. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.2.2 with regard to building and/or structure height. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7). The maximum allowed height is 60 feet. The proposed structure is 36' 4" (see FINDING #F8)
- F23. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.2.3 with regard to setbacks, separation of buildings, and accessibility. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, and FINDING #F10)

- F24. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.2.4 with regard to requirements for maximum ground coverage. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, and FINDING #F10)
- F25. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.2.5 with regard to landscape buffer zones/landscaping. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, and FINDING #F10)
- F26. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.3.1 with regard to the layout of streets and vehicular ways and pedestrian walkways. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, and FINDING #F10 and #F14)
- F27. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.3.2 with regard to parking. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, FINDINGS #F8 and #F10)
- F28. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.3.3 with regard to loading areas. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, FINDING #F10)
- F29. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.3.4 with regard to drainage. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, FINDING #F12)
- F30. That the Application **meets / does not meet** the requirements of Section 9.6.4 with regard to signs. (See EXHIBITS #1 and #7, FINDING #F15)

V. DECISION

At their meeting of _____ after due consideration of the exhibits submitted and the entire record of proceedings introduced and accepted in this matter, the Grafton Planning Board (motion by _____, seconded by _____) voted - to **APPROVE / DENY** the Project Plan Review with the following conditions:

- C1. This Approval is specifically for the construction of a 14,364 square foot equine sports medicine facility to include an unheated arena, heated support space and associated parking as shown on EXHIBITS #1 and #7 of this Decision. Unless modified by the Conditions of this Project Plan Review Approval, the Site with respect to the project/use authorized under this Decision shall be constructed and maintained as shown on the Plans identified in the EXHIBITS of this Decision and in accordance with the Grafton Zoning By-law.
- C2. Signage for, and associated with, the project authorized by this Decision shall be installed in accordance with, and conform to, the Town of Grafton Zoning By-law. This Decision shall not be construed as approving or authorizing any such signage. (See FINDING #F15)
- C3. Prior to the issuance of building permit for the new building, the Applicant shall receive written approval from the Fire Department that the fire hydrant identify in FINDING #F15 has been relocated to their satisfaction and according to plan (see EXHIBIT #7). A copy of the written approval shall be submitted to the Planning Department.
- C4. Prior to the issuance of a building permit for the new building, the Applicant shall submit and receive Town approval of a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) regarding the new stormwater drainage system. It shall address the Owner's understanding that this system is the sole responsibility of the

Owner with regards to maintenance and repair of the system including but not limited to the new open stormwater basin to be constructed north of Route 30. This MOU is to be incorporated into the campus operations and management plan. The MOU shall require review and approval by the Town after review by the Department of Public Works, Engineering Department, Conservation Agent and Planning Department. The Applicant shall coordinate with the Town Planner as to the form and authorization by the Town.

- C5.** This Approval shall not be construed as final approval of any on- or off-site improvements or work (such as water, sewer, drainage, or other utilities installation) associated with this project and shown on the Plans. All applicable Federal, State and Local approvals/permits shall be obtained by the Applicant prior to the construction of any portion of the development or off-site improvements that warrant such approvals/permits.
- C6.** Any modification to the project/use authorized by this Decision and/or site improvements as described within this Decision and as presented to the Board during the public meeting and in the above referenced EXHIBITS shall require, prior to implementing such change, a determination from the Planning Board as to whether the proposed change is substantially different than presented in the materials and information used in making this Decision. The Planning Board reserves the right to solicit comments from other Town boards, departments and committees, as well as its consulting engineer, in making determinations regarding such changes. The Planning Board may, upon its determination, require a modification of this Decision (or other approvals if deemed necessary) if it finds that the proposed changes are substantial in nature and of public concern, and substantially alter the plans and information used in making this Decision. Any Modification of this Decision shall be made pursuant to Section 9.6.1.2 of the Zoning By-law, and any other applicable regulations.
- C7.** The Planning Board reserves the right, pursuant to Section 9.6.1.2.D of the ZBL, to utilize the services of a professional engineer in reviewing any materials required to be submitted as conditions of this Decision, or conducting any inspections or other work associated with the construction of the project. In accordance with Section 9.6.1.2.D, any fees or expenses associated with such reviews shall be the responsibility of the Applicant. Such inspections or reviews will not be conducted if a zero or negative balance exists in any account established by the Planning Board for the purposes stated in this Condition.

VI. RECORD OF VOTE

Constituting a majority of the Planning Board, the following members voted - to **APPROVE / DENY** the Application for a Project Plan Review for an Equine Sports Medicine Center and Associated Parking based on the information received at the public meeting and the aforementioned findings, and subject to the aforementioned conditions.

<u>Michael Scully, Vice Chairman</u>	<u>AYE / NAY</u>	<u>David Robbins</u>	<u>AYE / NAY</u>
<u>Robert Hassinger, Clerk</u>	<u>AYE / NAY</u>	<u>Linda Hassinger</u>	<u>AYE / NAY</u>

DATE OF FILING OF DECISION: BY ORDER OF THE BOARD

Joseph Laydon, Town Planner

Date

cc: Applicant / Owner
Building Inspector
Assessor
Graves Engineering

DRAFT